

PB Voting in Chicago's 49th Ward, 2010

The recent PB votes in Chicago can be educational.

Some people in the PB movement say, "The community chooses its own voting method." This is misleading in cities where people have used only one type of voting: plurality rules.

\$1,324,000 was available.

About 1,600 voters cast ballots. 12,284 votes were cast. A voter could cast up to 8 votes on a ballot but could give only 1 vote to an item. No Cumulative Voting was allowed.

Under the tally in the middle, which is unconcerned with costs, 14 items won. Under the cost-aware tally on the right, only the most expensive winner would have lost. Ten cost-efficient items would take its place.

The most popular project was supported by less than half of the voters. They could have won even if it had cost \$1,000,000.

We could say the cost-aware or fair-\$ result beats the uneconomic result by 9,924 votes to 8,055 votes. That is 1,869 more votes or 23 percent more. Better voting rules such as MMV would give even better results because they leave fewer wasted votes.

Project Title	Proposed Budget	Votes Cast	Uneconomic Rank	Result	One vote for every	\$/Vote	Votes of ≈Value	Fair \$ Rank	Fair \$ Result
Intersection safety at Clark and Farwell	\$2,600	334	15		1 vote for	\$8	385	1	Won
Speed Humps on 1100-1200 W. Greenleaf	\$3,500	181	22		1 vote for	\$19	155	2	Won
Community Gardens in Dubkin Park	\$33,000	741	4	Won	1 vote for	\$45	67	3	Won
Police Camera at Sheridan and Greenleaf	\$13,000	246	19		1 vote for	\$53	57	4	Won
Police Camera at Damen and Rogers	\$13,000	235	20		1 vote for	\$55	54	5	Won
Completion of Path in Touhy Park	\$25,000	428	12	Won	1 vote for	\$58	51	6	Won
Free Wi-Fi on 1600-1700 W. Howard	\$24,600	334	15		1 vote for	\$74	41	7	Won
Street Repair: 1300-1500 Jarvis & 7000 Paulina	\$13,000	171	23		1 vote for	\$76	39	8	Won
Street Lighting: 1400-1600 W. Juneway	\$13,000	161	24		1 vote for	\$81	37	9	Won
Solar-Powered Garbage Containers on Sheridan	\$41,000	468	10	Won	1 vote for	\$88	34	10	Won
Renovate Cultural Center at Berger Park	\$25,000	269	18		1 vote for	\$93	32	11	Won
Rogers Park Historical Signs	\$42,000	391	13	Won	1 vote for	\$107	28	12	Won
Convenience showers at Loyola Park Beach	\$50,000	457	11	Won	1 vote for	\$109	27	13	Won
Underpass Murals	\$84,000	740	5	Won	1 vote for	\$114	26	14	Won
Bike Lanes	\$100,000	837	2	Won	1 vote for	\$119	25	15	Won
Dog Friendly Area at Pottawattomie Park	\$110,000	762	3	Won	1 vote for	\$144	21	16	Won
More Benches and Shelters on CTA "El" Platforms	\$84,000	487	8	Won	1 vote for	\$172	17	17	Won
Sidewalk Repairs	\$188,292	910	1	Won	1 vote for	\$207	14	18	Won
Artistic Multifunctional Bike Racks	\$105,000	489	7	Won	1 vote for	\$215	14	18	Won
Street Repairs: W. Lunt 1600-1750 & 1900-2100	\$102,000	480	9	Won	1 vote for	\$213	14	18	Won
Street Lighting: 1500 to 1600 W. Greenleaf	\$65,000	277	17		1 vote for	\$235	13	21	Won
Street Lighting: 1200-1350 W. Morse	\$130,000	371	14	Won	1 vote for	\$350	9	22	Won
Police Camera at Lunt and Paulina	\$55,000	155	25		1 vote for	\$355	8	23	Won
Street Resurfacing: 1200-1500 W. Lunt	\$93,500	210	21		1 vote for	\$445	7	24	
Traffic/Pedestrian Signal on Clark at Chase	\$230,000	494	6	Won	1 vote for	\$466	6	25	
11 more street improvements that lost									
TOTALS	\$1,645,492	10,628	0	14	Number of	winning	projects	23	
				8,055	Supported	by __	votes	9,924	
				76%	% of	% of	votes	93%	

PB Voting in Chicago's 49th Ward, 2011

Some people in the PB movement say, "The community chooses its own voting method." This is misleading in cities where people have used only one kind of voting: plurality rules.

Values of votes in 2011

\$480,000 was available.

About 1,000 voters cast ballots.

4,884 votes were cast.

The average value of a vote was almost \$100.

A voter could cast up to 6 votes on a ballot – but could give only 1 vote to an item. No Cumulative Voting was allowed.

Even the winning votes were wildly unequal! A vote for the Bike Racks was worth only \$31. But a vote for the Playground was worth \$501. That's 16 to 1.

More than half the votes were completely 'wasted', because 2562 votes, a majority, got nothing. The Fair \$ Result on the right raises the

number of winning votes from 2,322 up to 3,074. That raises the percentage from 48% up to 63%, almost one-third more votes for this set of winners!

We could say the cost-aware or fair-\$ result beats the uneconomic result by 3,074 votes to 2,322 votes. All voting rules leave some wasted votes, but plurality rules are the worst.

http://accuratedemocracy.com/p_need2.htm

Project Title	Proposed Budget	Votes Cast	Uneconomic Rank	Result	One vote for every	\$/Vote	Votes of ≈Value	Fair \$ Rank	Fair \$ Result
Bike Racks	\$12,000	388	3	Won	1 vote for	\$31	388	1	Won
Metra Underpass Renovation at Birchwood, Touhy & Estes	\$15,000	359	4	Won	1 vote for	\$42	287	2	Won
Neighborhood Kiosks	\$15,000	189	12		1 vote for	\$79	151	3	Won
Additional Funds for Pottawatomie Park Dog Park	\$45,000	297	7		1 vote for	\$152	79	4	Won
Improve the Intersection of Ridge, Touhy and Rogers	\$75,000	494	1	Won	1 vote for	\$152	79	4	Won
Decorative Light Poles	\$25,000	148	16		1 vote for	\$169	71	6	Won
Police Cameras at Lunt & Paulina, and Touhy & Sheridan	\$40,000	187	13		1 vote for	\$214	56	7	Won
Rogers Park Bike Network, Phase 2	\$90,000	407	2	Won	1 vote for	\$221	54	8	Won
Police Cameras by Loyola Park Fieldhouse, Rogers & Damen, and Estes & Glenwood.	\$60,000	253	8		1 vote for	\$237	51	9	Won
New Canopy at Rogers Park Metra Station	\$50,000	205	10		1 vote for	\$244	49	10	Won
Handicapped ramps and crosswalks at Ridge Blvd. and Chase Ave.	\$40,000	147	17		1 vote for	\$272	44	11	Won
Beach Path Extensions at Jarvis, Touhy and Morse	\$105,000	325	6	Won	1 vote for	\$323	37	12	
Sidewalk Repairs: 1944-46 W Touhy, 1901 and 2001 blocks of W Lunt, and 1247-65 W Columbia	\$55,000	116	19		1 vote for	\$474	25	13	
New Playground at Touhy Park	\$175,000	349	5	Won	1 vote for	\$501	24	14	
New Street Lights: on Morse Ave. Ravenswood Ave. to Clark St. & on Sherwin Ave. from Sheridan Rd. to the Lake.	\$120,000	198	11		1 vote for	\$606	20	15	
More Residential Street Lighting: Chase Ave & Birchwood Ave, from Ridge Blvd to Damen Ave.	\$60,000	98	20		1 vote for	\$612	20	15	
Sidewalk Repairs: 7201 W Claremont Ave, 2301 W Chase and 2101 W Fargo	\$145,000	212	9		1 vote for	\$684	18	17	
Sidewalk Repairs: 7202 N Hamilton Ave, 1147-51 W Pratt, 7300 N Rogers Ave and 1250 W Sherwin	\$95,000	126	18		1 vote for	\$754	16	18	
New Street Lights: Estes Ave., Asland Blvd. - Glenwood Ave.	\$120,000	153	14		1 vote for	\$784	15	19	
New Street Lights: Juneway Terr, Asland Ave. - Sheridan Rd	\$130,000	149	15		1 vote for	\$872	14	20	
Ashland and Greenleaf Traffic/Pedestrian Signal	\$320,000	84	21		1 vote for	\$3,810	3	21	
TOTALS	\$1,792,000	4,884		6	Number of	winning projects		11	
				2,322	Supported	by ___ votes		3,074	
				48%		% of votes		63%	